

Ethnic Minorities and Access to Justice in the Russian Federation

Cooperation between Ethnic Minorities and the Police at Local Level



A publication based on the Russian-British partnership project Ethnic Minorities and Access to Justice

This publication has been produced with the assistance of the European Union and the Foreign and Commonwealth Office. The content of this publication is the sole responsibility of European Dialogue and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union or the Foreign and Commonwealth Office.



Foreign and
Commonwealth Office

Published:
European Dialogue
175 Goswell Road
London EC1V 7HJ
UK
Tel: +44 (0) 207 253 3337
Fax: +44 (0) 207 253 5790
info@europeandialogue.org
www.europeandialogue.org

First published 2006

ISBN 0-9549740-1-8

Design:
Elizabeth Campling, EuropeanDialogue

Layout:
Kavita Graphics

Printed:
Centre-Point Colour (UK) Ltd

Translation:
Maria Netchaeva

Ethnic Minorities and Access to Justice in the Russian Federation

Cooperation between Ethnic Minorities and the Police at Local Level

A publication based on the Russian-British partnership project Ethnic Minorities and Access to Justice

Prepared by
Girina Holland, European Dialogue

With the input of
Nicky Torode, Consultant
Dr Robin Oakley, Consultant
Ashot Airapetian, Center for
Interethnic Cooperation
Igor Krasavin, Roma Ural

For further information please contact:

European Dialogue, info@europeandialogue.org (English)
Center for Interethnic Cooperation, center@interethnic.org
Roma Ural, romur@mail.ur.ru

Front cover image: Police Officers and British Consultants, 1st Training Seminar, Ekaterinburg

Ethnic Minorities and Access to Justice in the Russian Federation

Preface

Policing is one of the foundations of the modern democratic state. Across the European region, states are striving to build police organisations that can sustain law and order while maintaining also the trust and confidence of all sections of the community in the way they perform their task.

Ethnic diversity presents a special challenge to the police. Established ethnic groups vary in the extent to which they have access to justice and are integrated into the life of the state. Also, migration is constantly increasing the ethnic diversity of nation states across Europe, adding new dimensions to the established composition of populations.

These issues confront the police and civil society as much in Russia as in most other parts of Europe. Building on more general foundations already established by the Russian government and NGOs in areas such as community policing and civil society development, the project described in this report focused directly on establishing methods for cooperation between public authorities and NGOs at the local level to improve relations between police and minorities – both to prevent and solve problems, and to promote mutual understanding and confidence generally.

The project benefited from excellent cooperation between the three project NGO partners and the Ministry of the Interior, as well as from the regional authorities in the four regions in which it was carried out - along with the many local national and ethnic minority associations that participated in it. It had clear positive outcomes in terms of the structures that were established and the initiatives that were undertaken, and these are not only being sustained locally but also disseminated by the relevant government ministries across the Russian Federation.

The project is also an excellent example of international cooperation, as it involved direct exchange of experience between the Russian Federation and the UK, where a history of tensions between police and minorities has required these issues to be addressed since the early 1980s. The funding support provided by the EU's European Initiative on Democracy and Human Rights and by the UK Government's Global Opportunities Fund provided an essential basis for the project.

This report should be read not only by those with an interest in police-community relations within the Russian Federation. It describes examples of good practice that are also worthy of attention by states throughout the European region. In particular, the various initiatives established jointly by the police, governmental authorities and NGOs in the four regions may be seen as valuable examples for implementing the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities' recently published Recommendations on Policing in Multi-Ethnic Societies, which are aimed at states across the OSCE Area.

Dr Robin Oakley

Specialist Adviser to the EMAJ Project

Consultant to OSCE and Council of Europe on Policing and Minority Issues

Contents

	Introduction	2
1	Background and Overview of the Project	4
	1.1 Setting the Context	4
	1.2 Methodology	5
	1.3 Activities	6
	1.4 Project Partner Organisations	8
	1.5 Results	9
2	Ethnic Minority Empowerment	12
	2.1 Empowerment and its relevance within the project	12
	2.2 The project's foci of empowerment	12
	2.3 Working as equal partners with the police and authorities	13
	2.4 Organisational management skills	13
	2.5 Cooperation between ethnic minority organisations	14
	2.6 Awareness of rights and legal literacy	16
3	Building Partnership Within a Community Policing Framework	20
	3.1 Community Policing	20
	3.2 Understanding the meaning of partnership within the framework of community policing	21
	3.3 Building partnerships	23
	3.4 Examples of partnership work	24
	Annexes	28
	Annex 1 Recommendations for Future Action	28
	Annex 2 Draft Ekaterinburg Partnership Agreement	30
	Acknowledgements	34

Introduction



Introduction

"Ethnic Minorities and Access to Justice" (EMAJ) was a Russian-British partnership project carried out over the period of 2.5 years with the participation of police officers, ethnic minority representatives and regional authority officials in 4 Russian cities/regions: Samara Oblast, Moscow, Ekaterinburg and Krasnodar Krai.

The project's main goal has been to foster trust and dialogue between the police and ethnic minorities and to create the basis for a long-term partnership at the local level through which current problems in the relationship between the police and ethnic minorities could be jointly addressed and resolved.

The project was coordinated by the *"Center for Interethnic Cooperation"* (Moscow), the Ekaterinburg National Cultural Autonomy of Roma *"Roma Ural"*, and *"European Dialogue"* (London), and worked in close cooperation with the International Cooperation Department (10th Department) of the of the Central Personnel Directorate of the federal Ministry for Internal Affairs (MIA).

The aim of this publication is not only to share the project methodology, but more importantly to show the developments and results that were driven by the project participants in each of the four cities. The publication's coverage of Russian good practice examples in ethnic minority – police relations will hopefully be of use as practical guidance material for police services, ethnic minority communities and local authorities throughout the Russian Federation and of interest for states across the European region.

The publication is divided into three chapters. The first chapter provides the reader with an overview of the project, which includes general background and context in which the project was designed and implemented; information on the methodology used; project activities; and a brief summary of the results of the project.

Following on from this are two chapters, which correlate to the central aims of the project: ethnic minority empowerment, and building dialogue and partnerships.

The second chapter covers the meaning and importance of ethnic minority empowerment within the framework of the project. It discusses the role of NGOs working on behalf of ethnic minority communities and stresses that ethnic minority empowerment is a prerequisite for effective cooperation with the police.

The third chapter looks at partnership building between the police and ethnic minorities guided by a community-based approach to policing. It covers key principles of partnership work and provides examples of cooperation that have been developed in each of the four project cities/regions.

Background and Overview of the Project



Background and Overview of the Project

1.1 Setting the Context

Russia's Constitution, the Criminal Code, specific domestic legislation, and the international laws and agreements that Russia is party to, are all evidence of Russia's general *de jure* commitment to democratic principles and the provision of equality and justice to all its citizens regardless of their race, ethnicity, gender or religion.

In addition, the recent shift from communism to democracy has also resulted in greater acknowledgement and promotion by the Russian State of the country's cultural diversity, and the role that Russia's ethnic minority communities have played in shaping and enriching the country throughout its history.

Recognising the pivotal role that the police play in protecting and securing the rights of all citizens, and acknowledging that weaknesses exist in the provision of equal access to justice for ethnic minorities by law enforcement agencies, the project "Ethnic Minority and Access to Justice" set out to work with the police and ethnic minorities at the local level to jointly address some of the challenges that policing within a democratic and ethnically diverse society brings.

The importance of ...

Trust

The current and often strong mistrust that frequently exists between representatives of ethnic minority communities and the police constitutes a great obstacle to the ability of the police to conduct their work in the most effective and professional way.

Due to negative past experiences with the police and/or just preconceived ideas about the police, many ethnic minority representatives are unwilling to report crimes they witnessed, to assist the police with their investigations, and even do not seek police support and protection as victims of crime. This means that the police are not reaching many of the citizens on whose behalf they are working, and who ought to feel protected by and engaged with this essential public service body.

Dialogue

One of the key responsibilities of the police is to protect the rule of law. In order for the police to meet this demand and to deal with and judge situations in the most appropriate and effective manner, the police need to maintain an objective and realistic view of society. Specific knowledge and understanding of the different individuals and groups that make up society and who are all the target of police work (both as victims and as perpetrators), can best be obtained through engaging directly with civil society. As the EMAJ project shows, dialogue breaks mistrust and challenges prejudices and unfounded stereotypes on both sides. By engaging in a

constructive dialogue with ethnic minority communities, the police can broaden their understanding of and tailor relevant practices more efficiently to reach those communities. In turn, dialogue will enable ethnic minorities to better understand the work of the police and the challenges and problems they face.

Partnership

Regular consultation and cooperation with ethnic minority representatives and communities enables the police to address and prevent existing problems more effectively, to improve professional standards, and to guarantee equal access to justice for ethnic minority communities. Working in partnership can take a variety of forms and, as the EMAJ project demonstrated, can range from holding regular joint meetings through to the participation of ethnic minority representatives in police training.

1.2 Methodology

The project methodology and activities were chosen and developed to achieve the best possible results in building *trust, dialogue and facilitating partnerships* between ethnic minority communities and the police. The project consisted of three main blocks of activities:

- ❖ a cycle of two training seminars in each region;
- ❖ study visits to the UK; and
- ❖ the implementation of local level initiatives, in the project referred to as microprojects.

Central to all of these activities was the promotion of a climate of *mutual respect and non-confrontation* between the police and ethnic minority participants.

While the project worked in cooperation with the federal Ministry of Internal Affairs (MIA), most of the project activities were implemented and *targeted at the local/regional level*. The local level is the main interface between the police and ethnic minorities and where problems in police-ethnic minority relations primarily occur. Therefore, the project worked mainly with police officers and ethnic minority representatives in their respective cities/regions (in Samara, in Moscow, in Ekaterinburg, in Krasnodar). This enabled participants to make contacts, build cooperation according to locally relevant issues, and to meet and continue working together independently from the project and beyond the project's duration.

In order to support ethnic minority organisations to become more effective in representing their communities and to work with the police and authorities as strong and equal partner, the project carried out some additional activities aimed at *ethnic minority empowerment*.

While the focus of EMAJ was to improve the relation between the police and ethnic minority representatives, the active *participation of the local and regional authorities* in the processes of cooperation and partnership building is very important. Local and/or regional authorities can act as facilitators in forging cooperation

between the police and ethnic minorities, and make vital contributions to the partnership with their expertise and additional resources.

Disseminating the positive results from the four cities and supporting the **institutionalisation** of structures of co-operation, constituted other vital components of the project. Therefore, the very active support that came from the Ministry for Regional Development (Department for Interethnic Relations) and the endorsement from the Prime Minister's Office in relation to a list of recommendations for future action were highly appreciated. (For the list of recommendations, please see Annex). Support from the federal ministries and Government facilitates the involvement of other regions in adopting a partnership approach to more effectively address ethnic minority – police relations, and has paved the way to developing structures of consultation and cooperation at the federal level .

The project activities were implemented by a team of **Russian and UK trainers and experts**.

The Russian trainers and experts were responsible for the overall design of the training and other activities, for outlining the relevance of the project for the Russian context, introducing positive models of police-minority cooperation from Russia, and for the bridge-building methods used in the training.

The UK experts who participated in the project's training, and hosted the UK study visit, were two former senior police officers from the London Metropolitan Police, together with two experts on community development from the Racial Equality Council in the Greenwich district of London. The UK team has worked together over many years in London and developed effective models of community-based policing based on structures that allow regular exchange, consultation and cooperation between the police and ethnic minority representatives.

1.3 Activities

The cycle of two training seminars

In each of the four cities/regions ethnic minority, police and mainly regional authority representatives participated in a cycle of two training seminars. The political support received from the 10th Department of the Central Personnel Directorate of the MIA has been vital, particularly at the beginning, to ensure the attendance of police officers at the training. Most training seminars were organised by one of the Russian project partner NGOs in cooperation with the respective regional administration.

The deployment of an experienced and highly professional trainer with skills in conflict-mediation and partnership-building was of utmost importance to secure the desired outcomes.

The first training seminar

The first training was seen by many as a historic event as it was the very first time for ethnic minority representatives and the police to engage in a training setting, in a non-adversarial manner and in constructive dialogue.

The training started with separate sessions for police and ethnic minority participants. The police sessions focused on police specific issues, such as operational procedures for gaining trust and working with communities, and application of international policing standards within the Russian context. Meanwhile, ethnic minority participants could focus on how to strengthen ethnic minority organisations to become stronger representative agencies of their respective communities and constructive and equal partners of public authorities.

In addition, these initial sessions were an opportunity for both police and ethnic minority participants to prepare themselves for the following joint sessions by first separately discussing and prioritising their respective perspectives on ethnic minority – police relations.

The joint sessions that followed successfully provided participants with a peaceful setting in which they could meet, critically reflect on their mutual negative stereotypes and start a dialogue to identify the main problems and discuss how to solve them together.

The second training seminar

The second part of the cycle gave participants the opportunity to agree on priority areas for cooperation and to discuss concrete steps for action, for which the micro-projects would offer a starting point (please see below).

UK Study Visit

From each city/region of the project, a group made up of ethnic minority representatives, police and regional authority officials came on a study visit to London to gain first-hand experience of best examples of UK policy and practice in ethnic minority-police cooperation. The visits were hosted by the aforementioned Greenwich Council for Racial Equality (GCRE), a non-governmental organisation who, in close cooperation with the authorities, aims to secure the adherence to, and effective implementation of, the UK's race equality legislation in the London Borough of Greenwich. The study visit participants looked at partnership structures between ethnic minorities, the police and local authority in Greenwich and city-wide. They visited Scotland Yard and other police institutions, such as London's Police Training Academy, to find out about the London Metropolitan Police's race equality and diversity strategy. The study visits were tailored and targeted to meet the specific areas of interest of each group of visitors.

The study visit format has proved to be a very effective means of sharing information and good practice models. Therefore, the project has also promoted the exchange of positive experience within Russia in the field of ethnic minority – police cooperation. The dissemination conference (please see below) provided the main platform for this. In addition, a number of relevant representatives from other than the four project regions were invited to attend project activities, such as the training seminars.

The Microprojects

In each of the four cities/regions, the project provided financial support for the implementation of one small project/ initiative to be developed by participants, aimed at building cooperation between ethnic minorities and the police. In each

of the four sites, the microproject provided an opportunity to start applying their knowledge and skills in the areas of joint work discussed and prioritised during the training seminars. The proposal for the microproject had to be developed, as far as possible, by a team of ethnic minority, police and regional representatives. In Samara, for examples, the team to develop and implement the micro-project was elected by all participants during the 2nd part of the training cycle.

Capacity-building Training for Ethnic Minority Organisations

The project carried out separate sessions and/or training seminars for ethnic minority representatives to build their skills in fundraising and proposal writing, organisational management and raise their capacity to work as confident and independent partners with public authorities.

Dissemination Conference

The dissemination conference took place towards the end of the project to promote good practice examples of police-ethnic minority cooperation in Russia especially from, but not only, the project's four cities/regions. Police, ethnic minority leaders and local/regional authority officials from over 20 regions of the RF, representatives from the Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry for Regional Development and the Ministry for External Affairs as well as a number of international experts attended the event.

During the working group sessions, participants had the opportunity to further exchange and discuss effective means of partnership building and worked on recommendations for future action. At the final session of the conference, a final list of recommendations for regional as well as federal level action was discussed and agreed, which was later sent for approval to the Office of the Prime Minister.

1.4 The Project Partner Organisations

The coordination, administration and overall implementation of the project was carried out in partnership between three NGOs: the Moscow-based organisation the "Center for Interethnic Cooperation", the Ekaterinburg Cultural Autonomy of Roma "Roma Ural", and the London-based organisation "European Dialogue". The ***Center for Inter-Ethnic Cooperation (CIC)*** represents and works for, not one particular, but ethnic minority communities in general. CIC has extensive contacts with ethnic minority organisations across the regions and has built harmonious working relationship with many of the regional government departments working on ethnic affairs. In addition, it has considerable experience in training on NGO capacity building and techniques of cooperation with local authorities.

Roma Ural (RU) is an active organisation representing the Roma minority - one of the most marginalized and discriminated ethnic minorities in the RF. Roma Ural has been involved in a number of initiative and projects locally and country-wide that work on Roma integration whilst securing the preservation of Roma culture. In addition, RU has been an active member of the informal network of ethnic minority organisations in Ekaterinburg.

European Dialogue (ED) is a non-governmental organisation with many years of experience in working with civil society organisations and public authorities, such as the police, to promote integration of ethnic minority communities. ED facilitates the

exchange of good policy and practice from the UK and elsewhere in democratic institution building, anti-racism, conflict resolution, community development and human rights.

1.5 Positive Outcomes

Following the collapse of the Soviet Union, Russia has become an active member of a variety of international and European agencies and programmes that deal with international policing standards in relation to police ethics and human rights. The project assisted with translating this federal level activity into concrete policing practices at local level, resulting in greater public trust in the police and the improvement of operational procedures by the police to meet the challenges of policing in a multi-ethnic and democratic society.

"Militia men are human too"- comment by an ethnic minority participant after the first training in Ekaterinburg

Changing perceptions of each other

In each of the four cities/regions, the project assisted in countering the negative stereotypes and prejudices held by police against ethnic minorities and vice versa. Through speaking and sharing each other's perspectives, ethnic minority representatives and the police soon realised that the concerns they shared greatly outnumbered those they disagreed about. The initial doubts of participants regarding cooperation were overcome as both the police and ethnic minorities saw the benefits of jointly addressing existing problems.

The police found that increasing their knowledge of ethnic minority communities and hearing their perspective on the causes of conflict will be of great assistance in adjusting operational procedures to more effectively protect and gain support from communities which the police has most often found hard to reach. Ethnic minority representatives in turn realised that the police are concerned with providing a fair and equal service, and learned to understand the challenges and difficult decisions with which the police are frequently presented.

Introduce working tools to foster cooperation and dialogue

In each of the four cities/regions, a positive working relationship developed between ethnic minority representatives and the police, often with the participation of the regional authorities. Models and working tools to foster dialogue and cooperation that were promoted by the project were used and adapted by participants according to their specific local context and needs. In each of the regions, police and ethnic minorities have started to hold meetings and/or seminars to build dialogue and have begun working together on several of areas of mutual concern. Regional authorities have also increasingly applied structures of consultation with ethnic minority representatives to be able to more effectively address problems and adjust their policy programmes to the needs of these communities.

Examples of cooperation and partnership

In Krasnodar, the head of the police set up a Consultative Council, to which the Center of National Cultures of Krasnodar was invited as a regular member. Equally, the Samara City Police set up a Consultative Forum, which consists of representa-

tives from different civil society interest groups, including ethnic minorities.

Police training is another area prioritised by participants for cooperation. With the aim of providing police officers with more effective methods for preventing and resolving conflict, police and ethnic minority representatives started working together to develop or improve police training modules covering the cultural and religious background of ethnic minority communities. In Samara and Ekaterinburg, ethnic minority organisations worked with the respective MIA police training institutes. In Samara, a pilot training seminar organised by the MIA Training Institute for police officers from the city was extended to the regional police service.

In Moscow youth leaders of ethnic minority background explored, in a series of seminars, the causes of problems in the relationship between the police and young people, and are seeking to find opportunities to continue this dialogue and to deepen cooperation.

Extending Russian good practice examples within the RF

Following the positive results of the project training in the four regions/cities, a similar training was implemented in Volgograd, Saratov, Astrakhan and Krasnoyarsk after a request from the respective regional authorities.

The commitment of the participants and the support received from the Government and the federal Ministry for Regional Development regarding recommendations for future action, provide a good basis to build upon and extend the positive results to other regions.

Ethnic Minority Empowerment



Ethnic Minority Empowerment

2.1 The concept of Empowerment and its relevance within the project

Empowerment as a concept and working practice has been used in a variety of disciplines, including psychology, sociology and economics. Depending on the context in which it is used, it can be defined in a number of different ways.

Within the framework of the EMAJ project, empowerment is understood as a process by which ethnic minority communities gain greater control over, and increase their impact on, decisions and structures that affect their lives.

While there are certain aspects in the process of empowerment that can be treated in isolation - such as acquiring certain skills and knowledge - empowerment must be understood as *relational*. In the context of this project it is based on the *relation between* ethnic minority communities and the police and authorities, and their increased ability and will to enter into dialogue, share their respective knowledge and experience, and work together to address existing problems.

The project assisted in the process of ethnic minority empowerment by providing opportunities and resources for ethnic minority representative to gain experience, skills and greater confidence to enable them to engage with the police and authorities in a constructive way, to find effective means of challenging discrimination and to play an active part in making decisions and shaping approaches that will guarantee their equal access to justice.

Recognising the vital role that non-governmental representative bodies of ethnic minorities play in building and maintaining a democratic society, the EMAJ project sought to focus and strengthen these organisations.

2.2 The project's Foci of empowerment

Through the project activities, as outlined in chapter 1, as well as through a separate 2-day training seminar for ethnic minority leaders, the project worked on the following areas of ethnic minority empowerment:

- ❖ Increasing the confidence in and knowledge of effective mechanisms for working as equal and constructive partners with the police and authorities
- ❖ Increasing NGO as well as project management skills and strengthening the capacity of ethnic minority organisations (EMOs) to access financial resources (fundraising, proposal writing, budgeting)
- ❖ Increasing cooperation between ethnic minority organisations and providing effective models of how to do so
- ❖ Increasing awareness of rights and legal literacy (of relevant domestic and international laws)

2.3 Increasing the confidence in and knowledge of effective mechanisms for working as equal and constructive partners with the police and authorities

In order to enable ethnic minority communities to effectively participate in gaining equal access to justice and to all the rights and services that form the basis thereof, they need to have a platform through which they can voice their concerns and engage with the police and authorities to address them.

Ethnic minority leaders and their associated organisations, often local national cultural autonomies, represent the 'frontline' between the issues affecting their local communities and the bodies of state power responsible for their protection. Russia's ethnic minority organisations (EMOs) constitute a vital source of local knowledge and experience. Many of the ethnic minority leaders who head EMOs are dealing single-handedly with their respective community issues. Their experience and analysis of the problems and approaches taken for resolving them are vital. Increasing the confidence and capacity of ethnic minority organisations to share with the police the knowledge of their communities, and of areas where their safety is not fully guaranteed, is an essential step to proactively tackle existing problems.

2.4 Increasing organisational management skills and strengthening the capacity of EMO leaders to access financial resources

In Russia, in the heyday of perestroika in the mid 1980s, there was a fast growth in community mobilisation, which also led to the rapid increase of ethnic minority organisations. As a result, in most major Russian cities there are networks of ethnic minority organisations representing many of the local ethnic communities.

However, those ethnic minority organisations that have remained active until today - albeit run with an overwhelming degree of dedication and commitment - lack, in the majority of cases, human as well as financial resources. Most EMOs work without any office, personnel or equipment and often lack the financial means, experience and/or skills to address these shortcomings. This in turn significantly limits the scope of their activity and impact of these organisations.

Fundraising

While some of the active organisations receive occasional financial support from the local and regional authorities, relying on the authorities to cover all the expenses necessary for running a professional organisation is not realistic.

Therefore, ethnic minority organisations need to acquire the technical skills and knowledge of how to access funding from a variety of sources. The project covered *fundraising* training for EMOs, where ethnic minority representatives learned about the different possibilities of fundraising, i.e. businesses, public sector, different national and international foundations and grant programmes, and were given advice on writing a funding application and budgeting.

Moreover, the microproject component of the project gave participating EMOs the opportunity to gain experience in proposal writing, budgeting and project man-

agement. After writing a project proposal together with the police and regional authority, where possible, and submitting an application that fulfilled the microgrant criteria, a microgrant was awarded to a consortium of EMOs. Thus, while advancing the overall project goal of building cooperation between ethnic minorities and the police, the microproject also provided EMOs with the chance to acquire fundamental skills to strengthen their organisational capacity.

2.5 Increasing cooperation between ethnic minority organisations and providing effective models of how to do so

As an interest group vis-à-vis the state, different ethnic minorities often share similar needs and concerns, i.e. maintenance of their respective cultural traditions and/or languages, challenging stereotypes and racism, etc. Working together on issues of similar interest and concern, is, for a number of reasons, far more effective than acting as separate entities/ separate ethnic minority organisations only.

There are a number of ways in which ethnic minority organisations representing one particular community, such as national cultural autonomies, can cooperate in effectively building and maintaining partnership structures with the police and local/regional authorities to solve common problems and pursue shared interests.

2.a

Creation of a Media Centre and Website in Krasnodar

The Center of National Cultures is an organisation that sets out to represent a variety of ethnic minority communities living in Krasnodar. With the help of this project, the Center of National Cultures created a local computer network to which all other ethnic minority organisations working in the Center of National Cultures have access, and which they can use to exchange information and work more effectively together. The project has also assisted with the creation of an internet site for and by the Krai's ethnic minority communities, providing information on the different organisations and relevant information on events as well as legal and practical advice.

Ethnic minority leaders in Samara and Ekaterinburg also created a website to be updated and used by ethnic minority communities residing in the respective region.

Website addresses: Krasnodar: <http://www.kubanetnos.ru>

Samara: <http://etnosfera.net> **Ekaterinburg:** www.narodural.ru

Cooperating via one representative umbrella organisation

One model which met with great approval by participating ethnic minorities and authority representatives alike was that of the Greenwich Council for Racial Equality (GCRE) in London. GCRE works on behalf of all ethnic minority communities that reside in the London Borough of Greenwich (see box 2.b for further details). The rationale behind an umbrella organisation such as GCRE is not to replace all other local ethnic minority organisations, but rather to constitute a unifying, repre-

sentative agency that can proficiently uphold dialogue and cooperation with the public authorities.

In Samara, ethnic minority organisations and a representative from the regional authority have started to discuss the possibility of restructuring the House of Friendship of the Nations by creating an agency that would act as an umbrella organisation for the region's ethnic minority communities. In Krasnodar, the Center of National Cultures has begun to set up structures to facilitate cooperation between Krai's different ethnic minority organisations, such as the creation of a media center (please see Box 2b for more details).

There are two great advantages to creating a unifying umbrella organisation in addition to local organisations representing specific ethnic minority communities:

- a) Greater representational power
- b) Greater cost effectiveness and access to financial resources

Greater representational power:

A representative non-governmental agency such as the Center of National Cultures in Krasnodar has the potential to provide assistance, address issues and solve problems that will benefit many ethnic minority communities and not just one particular community. The Greenwich Council for Racial Equality (GCRE) in London, for example, offers a whole range of support services that are being used by all the different ethnic minority communities in the district. Through its constant contact with the local communities, GCRE can gather information that allows it to make a realistic assessment of existing problems and areas of discrimination and draw up suitable and effective policy recommendations to address them.

A unified agency can be the first contact point and information source as well as a strong partner for the public authorities. For many years GCRE has closely worked with the police and local authority to jointly address shortcomings and find suitable solutions.

However, and very importantly, for any umbrella organisation to be truly representative and effective, it needs to have ***democratic and transparent structures***. It requires the equivalent of a management board, comprised of a range of elected members from different communities that staff remain accountable to at all times. In addition, the people who are employed by the management board to run the organisation need to be ***highly skilled and professional staff***, or else the organisation's achievements will be weakened and resources wasted.

Greater cost effectiveness and access to financial resources:

Running an umbrella organisation that covers a range of areas that would otherwise have to be taken on by a number of different ethnic minority organisations, is not only more efficient but also more cost effective (in particular staff and office costs). For funders, knowing that the organisation works on behalf of many different ethnic minorities is much more attractive than supporting an organisation working on the same issues but only targeting one specific ethnic minority community. Thus, the chances of accessing funding and setting up long-term programmes of com-

munity support and structures of co-operation with the authority, do increase.

2.b

Greenwich Council for Racial Equality, London, UK

Greenwich is one of the 32 Boroughs (independent municipalities) that make up the city of London. It is located in the south-east of the city, alongside the River Thames. Over the past fifty years, it has acquired a large multicultural population, including people from Africa, the Caribbean and various parts of Asia. Of its total population of 214,000, 25% are from ethnic minorities.

Greenwich Council for Racial Equality (GCRE) is an independent local non-governmental organisation (NGO), which promotes integration and helps to secure equal access to rights and services for all ethnic minorities residing in Greenwich. It is managed by an elected committee of its members, who are local residents or representatives of local organisations. Its work is carried out by a small number of paid professional staff, with the help of local volunteers. Its funding is obtained partly from the local government and partly from the state, as well as from other public and private sources (foundations, businesses, etc.).

GCRE's main aim is to work towards the elimination of discrimination and the promotion of equality of opportunity and good relations between the district's diverse ethnic communities.

For many years, GCRE has worked in close partnership with the police and local authority, especially in the area of preventing and dealing with racially motivated crimes and police training.

2.6 Increasing awareness of rights and legal literacy (of relevant domestic and international laws)

Often ethnic minority communities do not possess adequate knowledge of laws and decrees that exist to ensure all citizens' equal access to justice and protection from discriminatory and/or unlawful conduct. Lack of knowledge of these rights make people more vulnerable to violations of their rights, and prevents them from seeking redress in cases of rights abuse.

The project promoted greater legal literacy of ethnic minority communities, and covered some aspects of the rights of citizens when interacting with law enforcement agencies.

Through the many joint activities between representatives of the police and ethnic minorities, the project also managed to break the widely-held prejudice that the police service is not genuinely concerned about rights violations committed within their own ranks. The project demonstrated that the police endeavour to deliver a fair and equal service.

Therefore, cooperation between the police and ethnic minority representatives in curbing cases of rights violations committed by police officers will not only guarantee greater justice for ethnic minority communities but will also assist the police in mitigating poor or even unlawful performance within the service, and hence to improve their professional standards.

2c **Information Booklets for ethnic minorities**

As part of the microproject component of the project, participants produced a booklet for ethnic minority communities on the rights and duties of citizens when stopped by the police. The booklet also contains a list of numbers and addresses of the police, ethnic minority organisations and relevant departments of the regional authority, that ethnic minorities can turn to for assistance in case their rights have been violated by police officers.

In Krasnodar, ethnic minority, police and regional authority participants jointly produced a booklet on rights and duties of migrants. This booklet also contains contact numbers for the police, ethnic minority organisation and the regional government which migrants can contact for advice and support.

Building partnership within a Framework of Community Policing



Building partnership within a Framework of Community Policing

“We need to communicate more often, to identify common problems and look together for the right solutions” – comment by a police officer from Samara after the first joint training between ethnic minority representatives and the police

Gaining trust and being accountable to the public are central to effective policing within democratic societies. Due to the challenges faced by the police, gaining public consent and support is a continuous and difficult process. Community policing has proved to be a very successful approach to minimise these difficulties and to achieve sustainable positive relations between communities and the police. In Russia, introducing community based policing into regional police services has become part of state policy. Police officers in a number of regions have received training, some of which was conducted with an additional and specific focus such as business- police relations or dealing with domestic violence.

With its goal of finding long-term solutions to address the current lack of access to justice for ethnic minorities, the EMAJ project focused specifically on community policing methods that facilitate the building of cooperative partnerships between the police and ethnic minority communities.

3.1 Community Policing

Key principles and goals of community policing include:

- ❖ Needs-oriented service delivery
- ❖ Professional and accountable service
- ❖ Improved police- community relations
- ❖ Improved quality
- ❖ Police-public partnerships
- ❖ Emphasis on prevention
- ❖ Sustainable solutions

Community policing is a concept and widely used strategy that is founded upon the principle that the highest policing standards can best be achieved if the police work together with, rather than apart from, the public. Community policing enables the police to gain the public’s participation and support in maintaining order, solving crime and preventing conflict, while the public benefits from a more account-

able and professional policing service. Focusing on the local level and responding to local needs constitutes a vital part of community policing. Through increased engagement with and knowledge of communities in terms of their socio-economic and cultural background, the police are able to improve their procedures and approaches to reach and protect previously marginalized or alienated groups and provide equal access to its service to all.

Some critics accuse community policing as being 'soft on crime'. However, experience has shown that the exact opposite is true. Since the majority of the public is law-abiding, and suffer from rather than commit crime, their support gives the police a great advantage in solving and preventing crime and disorder.

In addition, community policing has proved in Europe and internationally to be a highly efficient approach to crisis management, and in preventing and dealing with public disorder, such as in situations of post-war interethnic conflict and/or processes of regime transformation.

3a Samara Police Reference File on ethnic minorities

Within the framework of the microproject, the regional administration, in cooperation with ethnic minority representatives and the police, produced a book for the police outlining cultural background, religion, history and traditions of ethnic minority communities residing in the region of Samara. This reference file is aimed at providing serving police officers with greater knowledge of the region's ethnic minorities and understanding of how to work more effectively with these communities.

As an organisational strategy of the police, community policing is very comprehensive and requires potential reform in a whole range of internal and external police structures and operational procedures.

Since the full coverage of strategies of community policing was neither the aim nor within the scope of the EMAJ project, the areas of community policing upon which this publication is focused are those that were of relevance to the project. With the aim of improving police-ethnic minority relations, the project focused on the aspect of community policing concerned with the *building of partnerships*.

3.2 Understanding the meaning of partnership within the framework of community policing

A partnership approach enables the police:

- ❖ to improve their knowledge of the local context and cultural background of ethnic minority communities
- ❖ to respond more effectively to the needs of these communities

- ❖ to jointly develop the most appropriate solutions to existing community safety issues, such as interethnic conflict, racially motivated crimes and general security issues

As the EMAJ project demonstrated, an essential precondition to working in partnership with ethnic minority communities is to build and maintain mutual trust and address existing negative stereotypes and prejudice.

3b Building Dialogue between the police and ethnic minority youth leaders

In Moscow, three ethnic minority Youth organisations (a Jewish, Armenian and German NGO) sought to address the wide-spread conflict between the police and young representative of ethnic minorities. With help from the microproject grant, they organised a series of two seminars to start building dialogue with the Moscow police and to develop mutual trust. A range of different young ethnic minority leaders and police from the Moscow Metro, the Migration & Passport and the Visa Service agreed to take part in the seminars even on an informal level. The outcome of the seminars was very positive. The negative mindset and prejudice against one another was challenged, shared views on existing problems were identified, and the will to further cooperate was established.

The Role of local/regional authorities

Local and/or regional authorities have a vital role to play in supporting and contributing to police-ethnic minority partnership. Often there are issues that the police and ethnic minorities want to tackle jointly but which fall partly within the scope of responsibility of, and cannot be addressed without the involvement of the local or regional authority. Moreover, through their frequent interaction with ethnic minority communities in other areas of service provision, local/regional authorities can be of great importance in initiating and facilitating cooperation between the police and ethnic minority communities.

Within the EMAJ project, the regional authorities, in most cities, have been very proactive and made vital contributions to driving and facilitating dialogue and partnership-building between the police and ethnic minority participants.

3c Policy Programme in Krasnodar

In Krasnodar, the regional administration adopted for 2005 a policy programme entitled "Harmonisation of Inter-ethnic Relations". Encouraged by the EMAJ project, the administration also organised a seminar for police and heads of ethnic minority organisations as part of its policy programme. The seminar focused on different forms of rights violations specifically committed against ethnic minority communities.

Moreover, the Krasnodar administration contributed logistically as well as financially to the EMAJ project's dissemination conference, which took place in Anapa.

3.3 Building partnerships

Experience from the project and beyond has shown that essential conditions for building successful partnerships are:

- ❖ to agree on the purpose of the partnership
- ❖ to define areas of cooperation
- ❖ to clearly identify the responsibilities and roles of each partner
- ❖ to create mechanisms for information exchange and regular consultation
- ❖ to involve and gain support from the local/regional authority

Another important factor to consider is **time**. As previously discussed, building trust between ethnic minority representatives and the police, and agreeing on the terms and conditions of the partnership, can be a long and difficult process.

Developing a formal Partnership Agreement

The most common and effective way for ensuring the above provision, is the development of a formal partnership agreement which outlines the terms and conditions of co-operation and partnership. The document needs to be prepared jointly and be signed by all parties to the partnership, to guarantee that the needs of all partners are considered, and equal ownership is granted. Furthermore, a formal agreement is a vital tool for ensuring that all parties have the same expectations of the partnership and each other's role within it, and for holding all partners accountable to their commitment.

Failing to clearly define terms and conditions can cause unnecessary conflict, destroy trust, or prevent potential partners from entering into a partnership. For example, one likely obstacle for police and ethnic minority cooperation is the mistrust and fear of ethnic minority representatives that they will be used solely as informers by the police, rather than as equal partners.

Potential fears or objections held by all sides concerning working together, as the

EMAJ project showed, need from the start to be openly addressed to counter mistrust and lay the basis for cooperation.

In the London Borough of Greenwich, the police, local authority and ethnic minorities (represented by the Greenwich Council for Racial Equality), jointly developed a formal partnership agreement focusing on partnership work to effectively deal with and prevent an increase in racially motivated crime. Areas singled out for cooperation in the agreement include, amongst others, supporting victims (and witnesses); improving standards for investigating racially motivated crime; a proactive approach to prevention; and the provision of confidentiality. The result of this partnership in Greenwich – the Greenwich Accord – has proved to be very successful in achieving its goal of improving trust in the police and policing standards and procedures when dealing with racially motivated crimes.

3d Developing Jointly a Framework Document for Cooperation

In Samara and Ekaterinburg respectively, representatives from the police, ethnic minorities and the regional authority worked together to develop a formal agreement to outline the areas of cooperation, as well as the terms and conditions upon which the partnership would be based. Areas of cooperation incorporated in the draft agreement included setting up a Commission on Ethnic Relations; cooperation in monitoring cases of discrimination; joint work with educational institutions, etc. Please see Annex 2 for a draft version of the Agreement developed in Ekaterinburg. Negotiations on the exact terms and conditions of the Agreement are still ongoing outside of and independent from the EMAJ project.

3.4 Examples of Partnership work

Whatever ethnic minorities and the police prioritise as urgent areas of cooperation, creating mechanisms for regular ethnic minority – police consultation and information exchange is an absolutely vital component of any effective partnership.

The mechanisms to facilitate regular communication and information exchange can take different forms. In the London Borough of Greenwich, for example, there are a number of consultative structures between the police and ethnic minority representatives, some of which include other civil society interest groups and specific local authority departments. In addition, most of them differ in their police representation; officers range from middle-rank officers up to Senior District Commander rank, depending on the purpose of the consultative structure.

Gaining better knowledge and understanding of ethnic minority communities and their needs are key benefits that both sides can gain from the partnership. Increased knowledge of the particular cultural background as well as socio-economic situation enables the police to tailor their procedures and approach accordingly. Identifying and prioritising local needs will determine the focus of partnership work.

During a project workshop in Moscow, for example, police and ethnic minority participants agreed that the current media representations of ethnic minorities contribute to increased racism, xenophobia and racially motivated crimes. In addition, participants suggested that the media's unscientific use of statistics and other information provided by the police, in turn increases mistrust of the police by ethnic minorities and consolidates mutual prejudices.

Thus participants discussed improving ethnic minority representations in the media as an additional area of cooperation.

3e

Creating structures of consultation in Samara and Krasnodar

In Samara and Krasnodar the respective police services set up a Consultative Forum/ Council to facilitate regular consultation with the city's civil society sector, including ethnic minority communities.

In Krasnodar, a range of meetings took place between ethnic minority representatives and different police departments and law enforcement agencies, including, at one time, the Prosecution Service. Each meeting had a particular focus and was aimed at exchanging perspectives on the cause of problems and discussing their potential solution.

In most of the cities/regions within the project, police and ethnic minority participants showed great interest in exploring cooperation in the field of police training. Involving ethnic minorities in police training is another highly effective means of building dialogue, challenging negative stereotypes and prejudice, while training police officers to prevent conflict and discrimination through a more culturally aware policing style.

Cooperation in police training can take the shape of jointly designing training materials, and/or of developing new modules for police training institutes, and/or of inviting ethnic minority representatives to participate and make a presentation during the training.

3f Police Training

In Samara, the deputy head of the Samara branch of the Saratov MIA Law Institute developed, in cooperation with ethnic minority representatives and the regional administration, a one-day police training seminar on policing in a multiethnic society. The training focused on effective management and prevention of inter-ethnic conflict and discrimination, providing an academic assessment of cause and effect, and stressing partnerships with ethnic minority leaders as a central preventative measure.

The training was mainly conducted by representatives from the MIA Institute but included presentations by ethnic minority representatives and the regional administration, giving their view on how to address existing problems and how to develop police-ethnic minority cooperation. The participating police officers from the Samara region were provided with the opportunity to ask questions of the ethnic minority representatives and engage in discussion on the issues addressed.

The series of training seminars that started in 2005 will be continued by the Samara branch of the MIA Law Institute in 2006.

In Ekaterinburg, ethnic minority representatives worked with the Ural MIA Law Institute to prepare material for police training on the history as well as cultural and religious background of ethnic minority communities in the Sverdlovsk region. The prepared materials and suggestions for training methods were discussed together with police psychologists during a roundtable. The final terms and conditions for the implementation of the training will form part of a meeting to be held outside the frame of the project.

Concluding Remarks

The results achieved in Moscow, Samara, Krasnodar and Ekaterinburg by police, ethnic minority and local/regional authority participants within the framework of the EMAJ project, show that the most important precondition exists, namely the *will* to work together and to jointly find solutions to current problems. The building of dialogue, cooperation and partnership structures that were facilitated by the project but essentially driven by participants, are evidence of the commitment of the Russian police and ethnic minorities to work on ensuring high quality policing that is fair and equally accessible to all citizens. However, building and maintaining high standards and public support is a continuous process of progress and setbacks. It is hoped that a focused vision of the benefits of ethnic minority- police cooperation will help all stakeholders to face the challenges and hard work that building partnerships can at times entail.

Annexes



ANNEX 1: Recommendations for Future Action

Recommendations from the Conference:

“Russian and International Experience of Cooperation between Ethnic Communities, Law Enforcement Agencies, and State Authorities”
Anapa, September 8-9, 2005

In an effort to facilitate the dialogue between ethnic minority communities, law-enforcement agencies and the authorities, and foster participation of civil society in the implementation of government policy, crime prevention, improving public security, elimination of nationalistic extremism and racially-motivated discrimination, the participants of the conference make the following suggestions:

1. For the Ministry of Regional Development of the RF – to develop recommendations for regional/local authorities on building cooperation between the authorities, law-enforcement agencies and ethnic minority communities upon consultation with ethnic minority experts and taking into account the provisions of the federal law of 6 October 2003 No 131-FZ “On the general principles of local self-governance in the Russian Federation” (Article 19), namely on the delegation of certain state powers to local self-governing bodies and allocation of governmental grants to local budgets aimed at assisting the implementation of these strategies.
2. To create an interdepartmental federal working group for the analysis of current implementation practices of the federal ethnic minority policies and for the preparation of new legislative proposals.
3. For the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the RF – to develop instructions for regional Central Directorates of Internal Affairs (GUVD) taking into account expert opinions from the Ministry of Regional Development of the RF and ethnic minority organizations (EMO) and ensuring the elimination of destructive opposition, challenging of ethnic-related prejudices and stereotypes, focusing on the successful cooperation between the police and ethnic minority communities in the sphere of policing, and also maintaining constitutionally guaranteed personal security and ethnic minorities’ rights to cultural and religious diversity.
4. Within the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the RF to create a special expert group of NGO representatives for the development of an effective strategy for regular interaction between law-enforcement agencies and ethnic minority communities, and for monitoring ethnic-related policies. The group shall meet at least every three months.
5. To propose an initiative to the Russian Government to consider an increase in salaries for police officers to provide for covering the real cost of decent living.
6. For the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the RF – to develop an academic module and study materials on the topic “Participation of law-enforcement agencies in facilitating agreement between different ethnic and faith

- communities” for Russian police training and re-training programs. Study materials should include sections on ethnic psychology, ethnic history of the region, cultural background of ethnic groups in the region, ethnic customs and traditions of the region’s major communities.
7. For the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the RF – to set up courses and training schemes, with participation of EMO and the authorities representatives, for community police forces throughout Russia on the ethnic background of communities and ways of building tolerant relations with ethnic minorities, based on courses developed by the Chief Personnel Directorate of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and successfully tested in Saratov and Rostov Regions.
 8. For the authorities of the federal subjects of the RF - in cooperation with corresponding Central Directorates of Internal Affairs (GUVVD) to develop special programs to prevent and counteract xenophobia, racism, ethnic and religious extremism in the modern multicultural society.
 9. For regional and local Directorates of Internal Affairs (GUVVD and UVD) – to train some police officers as ethnic community specialists building upon the experience gained in Krasnodar Region.
 10. For the authorities of the federal subjects of the RF – with the assistance from the police, to organize training of ethnic community representatives responsible for cooperation with that police building upon the experience gained at the House of Peoples’ Friendship in Kazan.
 11. For regional and local Directorates of Internal Affairs (GUVVD and UVD) – building upon the experience practiced in Krasnodar Region, to hold regular meetings between Heads of Directorates of Internal Affairs and regional ethnic minority leaders to address existing problems and assess procedures for tackling them.
 12. To create working groups with the participation of GUVVD officers, representatives of local authorities and ethnic minority leaders throughout Russia to develop and implement defined joint action plans. The results should be discussed at joint meetings at least once every quarter.
 13. To send an appeal to the Russian Government for the review of certain normative acts concerning migration regulations and the definition of the legal status of migrants in order to simplify the existing procedures of defining the legal status of migrants on the territory of the RF.
 14. For the Federal Migration Service of the RF - together with regional/local authorities, to consider the establishment of local centers for adaptation of migrants where necessary to prevent social tension and conflict.
 15. For the existing national and cultural autonomies – to create a coordination council to address common issues.
 16. To create budget-funded and publicly accountable resource centres for NGOs in each federal district.
 17. To send these recommendations, prepared and approved by the participants of the Anapa International Conference on 8-9 September 2005 with the aim to facilitate sustainable development and peace and edited by the Centre for Interethnic Cooperation, to relevant organisations and public bodies to be used as guidelines for the improvement of cooperation between ethnic minority communities, law-enforcement agencies and the authorities.

AGREEMENT No. _____

**Partnership between Ethnic Public Associations and the State
Department of Internal Affairs (SDIA) of the Sverdlovsk Region on Ethnic
Legal Relations in Sverdlovsk Region**

DRAFT

Ekaterinburg

“ ____ ” _____, 2004

The Governor of Sverdlovsk Region, SDIA of Sverdlovsk Region and representatives of ethnic public associations of Sverdlovsk Region, hereinafter referred to as the “Parties”, Issuing from mutual pursuit to build a stable civil society and united by their common future in Sverdlovsk Region, Proclaiming civil peace and concord, preserving historical state unity and issuing from commonly accepted principles of equality, Revering the memory of ancestors, who passed us their love and respect for our country along with their trust in kindness and justice, Trying to provide well-being and prosperity for Sverdlovsk Region, issuing from responsibility for our Motherland in the face of present and further generations, Considering ourselves as part of the world community and trying to observe the Constitution and citizens’ rights and freedoms in Sverdlovsk Region, Being convinced that cooperation between the Parties will provide for wide opportunities for conflict resolution by means of policy, respect for human rights and the rights of ethnic minorities, including freedom of movement, freedom of conscience, freedom to observe ethnic, religious and cultural traditions, the right to fair remuneration for work; protection from discrimination on any grounds; Acting in accordance with the Constitution of the Russian Federation and Regulations of Sverdlovsk Region, Have signed the agreement upon the following:

Article 1

Within the limits of their competence the Parties shall promote the further development and expansion of ethnic and cultural cooperation for the purpose of contributing to the stable development of Sverdlovsk Region in accordance with both active legislation of Sverdlovsk Region and commonly recognized legal standards and principles.

Article 2

Within the limits of their competence the Parties shall direct their efforts at providing conditions for conflict resolution by policy means and other joint activity to secure the observance of rights and guarantee the legal interests of people and citizens of the Russian Federation.

Article 3

With the purpose of developing cooperation between the Parties and providing favourable conditions for the further development of civil institutions the Commission on Ethnic Relations in Sverdlovsk Region shall be established.

The Commission on Ethnic Relations of Sverdlovsk Region shall be established at the Advisory Council on Ethnic Relations of Sverdlovsk Region.

The Commission on Ethnic Relations of Sverdlovsk Region shall aim to establish partnership relations, to improve knowledge/attitudes, to investigate infringements in ethnic legal relations, to coordinate cooperation between the Militia and ethnic minorities in determining efficient means, proposals and implementation of ethnic relations policy in Sverdlovsk Region.

The Administration of the Governor of Sverdlovsk Region, SDIA of Sverdlovsk Region and ethnic public associations of Sverdlovsk Region shall have equal representation at the Commission on Ethnic Relations.

A representative from the Administration of the Governor of Sverdlovsk Region shall be Chairman of the Commission on Ethnic Relations.

The Commission on Ethnic Relations shall be established within two months of the signing the present Agreement.

Quotas for ethnic public associations of Sverdlovsk Region shall be filled by election from ethnic public associations of Sverdlovsk Region.

Article 4

The Parties shall contribute to the exchange of representatives and experts in the field of ethnic legal relations, and consider possibilities for future joint activities aimed at reducing ethnic discrimination.

Article 5

The Parties shall thoroughly examine the facts of intolerance and discrimination on ethnic grounds by officers of law enforcement agencies, state authorities and municipal bodies of Sverdlovsk Region, as well as ethnic minorities. The results of examination shall be reported both to the instigator and the Advisory Council upon request regarding the course of investigation of ethnically/racially-motivated crimes. Decisions made by the Commission on Ethnic Relations shall be obligatory for all law enforcement agencies, state authorities, municipal bodies and public organizations of Sverdlovsk Region.

Article 6

The Parties shall regularly exchange statistical (non-personal) information with the main partners to achieve better coordination of their actions. They shall also develop a coordinated policy of interaction between law enforcement agencies, state and municipal bodies, and ethnic public associations of Sverdlovsk Region; and submit regular public reports regarding their activity within the framework of the present Agreement.

Article 7

Within the limits of their competence the Parties shall promote joint preventative events at educational institutions and other forms of cooperation between the Militia and public organizations.

Article 8

Within two months of the present Agreement coming into force the Parties shall determine the relevant services and structures which will be responsible for implementing the achieved arrangements, and will ensure the compliance with the agreed obligations.

The Parties shall promote the establishment of working relations between the state authorities, SDIA of Sverdlovsk Region and ethnic public associations of Sverdlovsk Region in order to share experience, outline priorities in contact development, cooperation and coordination of joint actions in problem-solving.

Article 9

Any alterations and amendments to this Agreement shall be made only upon the mutual consent of the Parties.

Alterations and amendments shall be documented as protocols which must be incorporated in the present Agreement.

Any discrepancies in either the understanding or implementation of paragraphs of the present Agreement shall be resolved through consultation and negotiation between the Parties.

Article 10

The present Agreement is concluded sine die and enters into force from the date of receipt of notification of the completion of the final procedures necessary for the Agreement to enter into force by the Parties. The present Agreement is valid for three months after receipt of written notification of the intention of any Party to withdraw from the Agreement.

The cancellation of the present Agreement shall not influence the implementation of any active projects carried out in accordance with the present Agreement. The implementation of such projects shall be governed by the agreed terms and conditions.

Concluded in Ekaterinburg " ____ " _____ 2004 in triplicate in the Russian language. The copies shall bear equal legal status.

PARTIES

Governor of Sverdlovsk Region

_____ /E.E.Rossel/

Stamp

Director of the SDIA of Sverdlovsk Region

General _____ /V.A.Vorotnikov/

Stamp

Ethnic Public Associations of Sverdlovsk Region

Acknowledgements

Project Coordinators

Ashot Airapetian, *Center for Interethnic Cooperation, Moscow*
Alexander Torokhov and Igor Krasavin, *Roma Ural, Ekaterinburg*
Girina Holland, *European Dialogue, London*

Team of Trainers and Consultants

Viktoriya Shoukhat, *Trainer Center for Interethnic Cooperation*
Nicky Torode, *Consultant on Human Rights and Ethnic Minority Issues*
Dr Robin Oakley, *Consultant to UK authorities and the Council of Europe*
Makhan S. Bajwa, *Director, Greenwich Council for Racial Equality*
Tony Cross, *former Chief Inspector of the London Metropolitan Police*
William Ekinu, *Race Equality Officer, Greenwich Council for Racial Equality*
Chris Taylor, *former Chief Inspector of the London Metropolitan Police*
Peter Mercer, *Director, East Anglian Gypsy Council*

Ministry for Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation

Colonel Ivan Shushkevich, *Central Personnel Directorate, Head of Educational Establishments, Human Resources and International Training Division*
Captain Margarita Efremova, *Senior Inspector, Central Personnel Directorate, Human Resources and International Cooperation*

Ministry for Regional Development of the Russian Federation

Ms Lydia Dyachenko, *Department for Interethnic Relations*

Ministry for Foreign Affairs

Sergei Barsukov, *Head of the Department for Humanitarian Cooperation and Human Rights*

UK Authorities and Institutions

Commission for Racial Equality
New Scotland Yard
Greenwich Police
Hendon Police College

Funders

European Union, European Initiative for Democracy and Human Rights
British Foreign and Commonwealth Office, Global Opportunities Fund