

#### NUSLIM PROBLEM RESEARCH CENTER IN RUSSIA

phone.: +7(347) 254-11-16 (mob.) +7 987-254-11-16 e-mail: r.latypov1976@gmail.com

## OSCE/ODIHR working session 12 (30.09.14)

# Report on the Situation in the Area of Hate Crimes against Muslims in Russia in 2013-14

Muslim problem research center in Russia submits an annual report on the hate crimes committed against Muslims in Russia.

The report is based on the information collected in the monitoring run by our Center.

#### Content:

- 1. Summary
- 2. The crimes against mosques
- 3. The crimes against Muslims committed by law enforcement officials based on the hate towards Islam and Muslims during investigative actions.
- 4. The crimes against Muslims
- 5. Desecration of graves
- 6. Muslims' websites attacks.

### **Summary**

On the whole in 2013 the number of hate crimes committed against Muslims increased. The tendency to further exacerbation of the situation and the rise of the number of such crimes is obvious, which certainly reflects the level of reduction of security for both the Muslims living in Russia and their mosques.

It should be noted that the situation in this sphere is often exacerbated with resonant crimes such as mass fights, explosions, that are yet in the early stages of the investigation, that is when the investigation and the court has not yet set the criminals, associated with Islam and Muslims. At the same time the media replicate willingly such news so affecting the public consciousness negatively and contributing to grow in it the feeling of hatred towards Islam and Muslims, which naturally entails the desecration of the mosques, attacks on Muslims from the direction of ordinary citizens and, in some cases of law enforcement agencies.

This can be traced on the basis of a small sample made from Russian media.

#### 2005. 1 message.

The mosque was desecrated in Penza. The attackers broke the window and wrote: "Long live the Russians!" on the wall.

#### 2006. 1 message.

In Kalmykia the Muslims, who came to the mosque on the morning prayer, found the broken windows, a large number of boulders and a swine head.

#### 2010. 1 message.

In Orenburg the police officers detained two young people who desecrated a town mosque with a Nazi fylfot.

#### 2011. 1 message.

The mosque was desecrated in Novotroitsk of Orenburg region. There were Nazi symbols and an inscription: "Death to Muslims".



#### 2012. 3 messages.

- 1. In Irkutsk the police officers detained two students who wrote some Nazi symbols on the walls of the town mosque.
- 2. In Chelyabinsk a student wrote the offensive inscriptions against Islam and Muslims. The offender is found and in 2013 was sentenced to two years probation.
- 3. In St. Petersburg two young men made a moulage of the explosive device and then put it the swine head. Then they went to the central mosque of the city and threw that swine head to the mosque gates, at that time there were many believers who came to pray collectively. The offenders were found. In April 2013 they were brought to justice

#### 2013. 9 messages.

Often the police investigating any crime, including those related to terror, during interrogations of alleged witnesses, use illegal methods that indicate that they are motivated by hatred towards Islam and Muslims. For example, they pour alcoholic drinks or put some bacon fat into witnesses' or detainees' mouth by force showing their determination to commit sexual violence against women as well as men.

The overall situation indicates the increase of the number of hate crimes committed against Muslims. However, Muslims avoid seeking any assistance from law enforcement agencies. They avoid any publicity disclosing their identity and any

circumstances of the incident. In connection with this it seems impossible to fix such crimes, because Muslims do not publicize such attacks, due to the presence of reasonable lack of confidence in law enforcement and the media.

Also the new types of hate crimes committed against Islam and Muslims have appeared, they include the hacking of websites and publishing the offensive symbols and sayings on them. In addition there are many accounts in social networks where their owners publish offensive materials toward Islam and Muslims on their pages, as well as make virtual attacks on accounts belonging to Muslims.

Here we should note that the Russian extremist legislation that has been repeatedly criticized by many international organizations, is used in a very one-sided and selective way. This is manifested in the fact that only in 2013 a few dozen of Muslims, who published some materials that have been recognized as "hate speech" by the court, were prosecuted, but on the other hand for the same reasons only few people who publish offensive materials towards Islam and Muslims on their accounts in social networks were sued.

It should be noted that law enforcement agencies have taken some successful efforts to catch the criminals who attacked the mosques and the Muslims because of hatred, but as we see these measures are not enough, because the whole situation is exacerbated, which calls for greater efforts to combat such crimes.

Also the federal and regional police administrations of various levels have community councils which include the staff of the Spiritual Administrations of the Muslims. There were lectures that gave a general idea about Islam in some regional and district administrations of the police. Perhaps the content of these lectures requires correction, because they are composed mainly to clarify differences between Russian traditional Islam and foreign, non-traditional Islam for Russia. Such formulations are purely of Russian origin, they are often used in various departmental instructions and orders. Often this approach contrary provokes the workers of the law enforcement agencies to have preconceived and sometimes illegal attitude towards those Muslims that in their opinion belong to a non-traditional Islam, that is they are not the part of the public religious institutions, such as the Spiritual Administration of the Muslims. The above efforts are not enough to change the situation with the growth of the hate crimes committed against Muslims, moreover, in some cases, instead of the positive results they lead to negative consequences.

# **Attacks on Mosques**

In 2013 we became known of the facts of 9 attacks on the mosques.

1. At the beginning of the year there was committed an attack in Voronezh. A Nazi fylfot was painted on the walls of the Muslim prayer house. The offenders are not found.



- 2. In January 2013 the mosque in Kirov was attacked. Unknown persons tried to pour some green paint on the windows, but got only on the walls. The offenders are not found.
- 3. At the end of January 2013 in Ryazan some unknown persons poured some red paint on the entrance door and the walls of the building where the Muslim prayer house is. By the entrance the swine legs were found with such leaflets as "No Islamization of Ryazan!", "Evpatiy Kolovratov's grandchildren are against Islam!", "Go away from Russian land". The offenders were found.
- 4. In June 2013 in Ivanovo under cover of night its three inhabitants wrote numerous obscene and insulting anti-Islamic inscriptions and a Nazi symbol. Then they put a swine head on a fence in front of the entrance to the mosque. The offenders were found in April 2014 and appeared before the court.
- 5. In August 2013 in Tatarstan the mosque "Farhat" was pelted with Molotov cocktails, only one of them flew to the religious building. The fire was extinguished by the inhabitants. The arsonists are not found
- 6. In September some unknown persons broke the windows of the mosque named after Kozha-Ahmet in Omsk. According to the press service of the Omsk police, the three windows on the first floor of the two-storied building were damaged and vandals wrote some insulting inscriptions on its facade. The offenders are not found.
- 7. Also in autumn a mosque that is in Moscow region in Balashikha was attacked. They wrote some Nazi symbols on the walls of the building. The offenders are not found.
- 8. On 22 October there was an attempt to arson a mosque in Volgograd. Some unknown persons pelted it with Molotov cocktails. The fire started inside the prayer room. The fire was liquidated by the worker living on the second floor of the building with his family. No victims. The offenders are not found.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Lsso46RUCYo&feature=youtu.be

9. On 24 October there was another attempt to arson a mosque in Volgograd. An unknown man pelted a Molotov cocktail, the window was burnt. The security man of the mosque extinguished the fire. The offender is not found.

# For the current eight months of 2014, also documented attacks mosques.

- 1. At the end of February 2014 a video was circulated in the Internet, it presents the story of desecration of the Quran and the territory of "Fatiha" mosque in Ufa with a swine's head. The video shows how two people in gloves tuck the Quran in Russian into swine's jaws, then they threw swine's head over the fence of the mosque. The video includes following comments of its creators: "We are well aware that swine is a filthy animal for you, so here's a swine with the Quran in the mouth", "After this none of the self-respecting Muslims would cross the threshold of "Fatiha" mosque, as well as the dating "Ufa, February 2014". In addition, it is accompanied by the song: "This little fat pig's been wagging his tail all day long, this fat pig's been scratching his tail on the fence ..."
  - 2. In February a young man because of "a sense of hatred towards the members of some nationalities, being near the village mosque Kil'mez' in Udmurtia, made the snow lines, containing the information aimed at inciting hatred and enmity, abasement of human dignity on the basis of nationality and provoking agitation of ethnic hatred and hostility on grounds of nationality". The offender was convicted.
  - 3. In July a mosque in Kalmykia was set on fire. The deputy Mufti of Kalmykia said that "According to eyewitnesses, two cars without license plates drove to the building, some people in masks went out and threw the firebombs to the chapel. It's good that there were no casualties".





4. Also in July an ancient mosque in Arkhangelsk burned down. The Council of Muftis of Russia believes that the fire was caused by arson. "According to a preliminary version the cause of the fire was arson" - said the statement of the Council of Muftis of Russia.



# The crimes against Muslims committed by law enforcement officials based on the hate towards Islam and Muslims during investigative actions

In March 2013 in Surgut about 15 masked police officers entered a Muslim café. According to eyewitnesses' words the visitors were threatened with submachine guns. Some of the Muslims' beards were cut by the police officers, the rest were forced under threats to cut beards themselves. Among the victims were the citizens of Tadzhikistan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan and Azerbaijan. One of the victims said: "I was told that if I didn't cut my beard myself with the scissors, they would burn it with the lighter". Later, at a press briefing the chief of the Surgut police Alexander Erokhov stated that in one of the Surgut cafes the police officers cut the Muslims' beards "as a part of the search operations". After that all the men were taken to the police department. Later all were released. On this incident, according to Erokhov's words The Administration of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Khanty-Mansi Autonomous District—Yugra started an internal inquiry. Its results are unknown.

Also in March 2013 in Moscow about 30 masked police officers entered the Muslim café "Dina", that is near the historical mosque at Bolshaya Tatarskaya street, not all of them were in uniform. Without identifying themselves, the masked men immediately at gunpoint forced all the visitors of the café to lie on the floor. There were about 30-40 visitors of different nationalities at that time (from the Northern Caucasus and Central Asia). The physical force was used towards the Muslims including butt beatings. One of the victims turned out to be an Armenian from Moscow who accepted Islam. Looking at

his documents the armed men began to insult him and say that "an Armenian who accepts Islam is considered to be an extremist in Russia". One of the witnesses of the conflict said that the men that got inside insulted the visitors of the cafe because of their religion and also named them "Muslim swines". He said that the masked men kept the people on the floor for half an hour, and then took 11 men and brought them to the police station "Zamoscoreche". In the police station the physical force was used towards the detainees then they were fingerprinted and released. They started an inquiry by the incident. The results are also unknown.

In December in Tatarstan within the framework of the criminal investigation "arsons of the churches" hundreds of Muslims were arrested as possible witnesses or persons that may have any information that could be useful to the investigating authorities. During the interrogation they forced the Muslims to drink vodka and eat bacon fat. Also they threatened of sexual violence, the detainees were taken off their clothes and the police officers showed them the things that might be used for violation. Galeev Almas lost his penis during his being in law enforcement agencies. Zaripov Rafael was tortured and as a result got a spine fracture and urinary bladder perforation. The members of the Human Rights Council under the president of RF went to the place of events, they prepared the report, in which confirmed the facts of violence towards the detainees. According to the facts an internal inquiry was started, its results are unknown.

Moreover, according to the human rights center "Memorial" there were not less than 12 cases of disappearance and kidnapping of Muslims in Moscow to which law enforcement agencies are probably involved. The human rights center "Memorial" informs with anxiety that the disappearance of people by "Caucasian scenario" has spread also in Moscow.

# The crimes against Muslims

#### 2013

The murders of the Muslim religious activists are continuing.

On 3 March 2013 the madrassa teacher Magomed Biyarslanov was killed in Gubden Karabudakhkentskiy district of Dagestan. On 3 August imam Ilyas Ilyasov was killed in Mahachkala. On 16 September the public and religious activist Gapaev Abdulla was killed. In April 2013 in Moscow a new twist has occurred in the case of disappearance of Famil Kuchev, imam from Dagestan. The law enforcement agencies supposed that he was killed and opened a criminal case on the similarly named article. The murders are unsolved.

In Nefteyugansk an imam of the mosque was attacked with the words "You pray wrong."

In Nizhnevartovsk a Muslim woman was attacked. The beating was prevented by the witnesses. She didn't apply to the police because of the fear that as a result she would be guilty herself.

In Ufa a Russian Muslim woman was beaten by her father. He restricted her freedom of movement, locked in. The motive of such actions was his dissatisfaction with her accepting Islam and wearing Muslim clothes. They threat her to take to a Christian monastery. She doesn't apply to the police.

In October in Volgograd a Muslim woman was attacked with fists and pushed out of the public transport. She didn't apply to the police.

On 5 January 2014 there appeared some videos with beating of the Muslims in Moscow underground. The beaten were forced to abandon Allah. Based on the comments to this video one can assume that these events occurred in the last hours of 2013. There are two Muslims on the video, their faces are in blood and a voiceover demand from them to abandon Allah, all these are accompanied with insulting words. Also the act of the Quran burning with insults is demonstrated in the same video. The videos are on YOUTUBE and have 150 thousands views. The criminal case was initiated. The victims themselves didn't apply to the police. Below there are links on these videos with English subtitles.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rsN7fJNKqVo&feature=youtu.be https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eTIKAcZRCdk&feature=youtu.be https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y2LABuxTBpI&feature=youtu.be

#### 2014

On 18 May, about 30 people, entered illegally the courtyard of a Muslim, his name's Rafis, from time to time everything that happened recorded on a video camera. One of the attackers was wearing a T-shirt with a yellow stylized nationalist swastika. The police came to the scene of the incident and did simply nothing, and the attackers were aggressive. The attackers shouted "We hate Muslims", shot at people from a traumatic weapons, and they wounded Rafis's wife in the arm. Also Rafis's face was smashed and his brother's head was broken, also a few Muslims who came to defend their co-religionist were suffered. Everything happened at the inactivity of the police that came by the victim's call. After the Muslim community's insisting a criminal case against unknown persons was started. However, from various facts not one of the attackers has been brought to responsibility.

## **Desecration of graves**

In June 2014 the Muslim cemetery visitors in Nezhinka village of the Orenburg district found that several graves were desecrated. Using spray paint some vandals wrote the obscene phrases on the tombstones.

#### Muslims' websites attacks

In 2013 there were hacking attacks on Muslim websites that could possibly be considered as the hate crimes committed against Islam and Muslims, as Russian criminal law considers an illegal access to computer information as a criminal offense (Art. 272 Criminal Code RF), the creation, use and distribution of malicious computer programs (Art.273 CC RF), the violation of the rules of computer operation (Article 274 of the Criminal Code). In October 2013, on the eve of the Muslim holiday Eid al-Adha three Muslim websites were hacked – The Council of Russian muftis, the site of the head of the Council of Russian muftis and Moscow cathedral mosque – the picture of the swine head and insulting words were published on them.

Based on the analysis of available data, we would like to recommend to the Russian Federation authorities the following:

- 1. Take measures that will lead to the investigation of the above attacks on Muslims and their objects of worship to the logical completion, that is, to detect criminals and their adequate punishment.
- 2. Take measures to reduce the Islamophobic hysteria in the media.
- 3. Create (taking into account the existing experience of ODIHR) training programs for law enforcement officers, in order to increase their level of education in the field of hate crimes against Muslims.
- 4. Direct law enforcement agencies' attention to the need for registration of all cases of hate crimes against Muslims.
- 5. Increase the degree of interaction between law enforcement and Muslim community organizations in the areas of prevention, registration, records and investigation of hate crimes against Muslims.

Muslim Problem Research Center in Russia

Rustem Latypov